Words of Power

The Institute of Ismaili Studies Shi'i Heritage Series, 3

Editorial Board: Farhad Daftary (general editor), Maria De Cillis (managing editor), Gurdofarid Miskinzoda (managing editor), Mohammad-Ali Amir-Moezzi, Hermann Landolt, Wilferd Madelung, Andrew Newman, Sabine Schmidtke, Paul E. Walker

Previously published titles:

1. Farhad Daftary. A History of Shi'i Islam (2013).

2. Farhad Daftary and Gurdofarid Miskinzoda, ed., *The Study of Shi'i Islam: History, Theology and Law* (2014).

Words of Power

Hurūfī Teachings between Shi^cism and Sufism in Medieval Islam

The Original Doctrine of Faḍl Allāh Astarābādī

> by Orkhan Mir-Kasimov

I.B.Tauris Publishers LONDON • NEW YORK in association with The Institute of Ismaili Studies LONDON, 2015 Published in 2015 by I.B.Tauris & Co. Ltd www.ibtauris.com

in association with The Institute of Ismaili Studies 210 Euston Road, London NW1 2DA www.iis.ac.uk

Distributed worldwide by I.B.Tauris & Co Ltd Registered office: 6 Salem Road, London W2 4BU

Copyright © Islamic Publications Ltd, 2015

All rights reserved. Except for brief quotations in a review, this book, or any part thereof, may not be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

ISBN: 978 1 78453 153 9 eISBN: 978 0 85773 849 3

A full CIP record for this book is available from the British Library A full CIP record is available from the Library of Congress

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: available

Typeset in Minion Tra for The Institute of Ismaili Studies

Printed and bound in Great Britain by T.J. International, Padstow, Cornwall





The Institute of Ismaili Studies

The Institute of Ismaili Studies was established in 1977 with the object of promoting scholarship and learning on Islam, in the historical as well as contemporary contexts, and a better understanding of its relationship with other societies and faiths.

The Institute's programmes encourage a perspective which is not confined to the theological and religious heritage of Islam, but seeks to explore the relationship of religious ideas to broader dimensions of society and culture. The programmes thus encourage an interdisciplinary approach to the materials of Islamic history and thought. Particular attention is also given to issues of modernity that arise as Muslims seek to relate their heritage to the contemporary situation.

Within the Islamic tradition, the Institute's programmes promote research on those areas which have, to date, received relatively little attention from scholars. These include the intellectual and literary expressions of Shi'ism in general, and Ismailism in particular.

In the context of Islamic societies, the Institute's programmes are informed by the full range and diversity of cultures in which Islam is practised today, from the Middle East, South and Central Asia, and Africa to the industrialised societies of the West, thus taking into consideration the variety of contexts that shape the ideals, beliefs and practices of the faith.

These objectives are realised through concrete programmes and activities organised and implemented by various departments of the Institute. The Institute also collaborates periodically, on a programmespecific basis, with other institutions of learning in the United Kingdom and abroad.

The Institute's academic publications fall into a number of interrelated categories:

- 1. Occasional papers or essays addressing broad themes of the relationship between religion and society, with special reference to Islam.
- 2. Works exploring specific aspects of Islamic faith and culture, or the contributions of individual Muslim thinkers or writers.
- 3. Editions or translations of significant primary or secondary texts.
- 4. Translations of poetic or literary texts that illustrate the rich heritage of spiritual, devotional and symbolic expressions in Muslim history.
- 5. Works on Ismaili history and thought, and the relationship of the Ismailis to other traditions, communities and schools of thought in Islam.
- 6. Proceedings of conferences and seminars sponsored by the Institute.
- 7. Bibliographical works and catalogues that document manuscripts, printed texts and other source materials.

This book falls into category two listed above.

In facilitating these and other publications, the Institute's sole aim is to encourage original research and analysis of relevant issues. While every effort is made to ensure that the publications are of a high academic standard, there is naturally bound to be a diversity of views, ideas and interpretations. As such, the opinions expressed in these publications must be understood as belonging to their authors alone.

Shi'i Heritage Series

Shi'i Muslims, with their rich intellectual and cultural heritage, have contributed significantly to the fecundity and diversity of the Islamic traditions throughout the centuries, enabling Islam to evolve and flourish both as a major religion and also as a civilisation. In spite of this, Shi'i Islam has received little scholarly attention in the West, either in medieval or modern times. It is only in recent decades that academic interest has focused increasingly on Shi'i Islam within the wider study of Islam.

The principal objective of the *Shi'i Heritage Series*, launched by The Institute of Ismaili Studies, is to enhance general knowledge of Shi'i Islam and promote a better understanding of its history, doctrines and practices in their historical and contemporary manifestations. Addressing all Shi'i communities, the series also aims to engage in discussions on theoretical and methodological issues, while inspiring further research in the field.

Works published in this series include monographs, collective volumes, editions and translations of primary texts, and bibliographical projects, bringing together some of the most significant themes in the study of Shi'i Islam through an interdisciplinary approach, and making them accessible to a wide readership. To the memory of my grandparents

Table of Contents

Note on Transliteration and Conventions		XI
Preface and Acknowledgements		
INTR	ODUCTION	1
Fadl Allāh Astarābādī and his Followers		1
Ov	verview of Academic Research and the Purpose of the	
	Present Book	23
Pu	zzle of Fragments: Structure and Language of the	
	Jāwidān-nāma-yi kabīr	31
PART	I: COSMOGONY AND COSMOLOGY: THE LANGU	AGE
O	F THE CREATION	45
1.	Primordial Unity: The Semantics of the Creation	49
2.	Manifestation of the Invisible: The Morphology of the	
	Creation	73
3.	Adam and Eve: The Form of the Word	95
4.	Excursus on Knowledge and Love	111
5.	Time: The Receptacle of the Word	141
6.	The Universe: Diversity in the Unity of the Word	161
PART	II: PROPHETOLOGY: THE DESCENT OF THE WO	RD
Al	ND ITS RETURN TO THE ORIGIN	211
7.	Adam and Eve: The Prototype of Prophetic Experience	
	and sr;the Personification of the Prophetic Cycle	217
8.	The Revelation (Tanzīl): From the Divine to the	
	Human Language	237
9.	From the Human Word to the Divine Word: Stages	
	of the Return to the Origin (Ta'wīl)	259
	Joseph: The Ta'wil of Compound Units	260
	Moses: Fragmentation and Ta'wil	263

Solomon: The 'Language of the Birds' 10. Jesus and Muḥammad: The 'Motherly' (<i>Ummī</i>)	267
Prophets between <i>Tanzil</i> and <i>Ta'wil</i>	273
Jesus, Son of Mary	273
Muhammad and the Revelation of the 'Mother of	275
the Book'	285
11. From Idrīs to Moses: Other Significant Features of	20)
the Prophetic Missions	305
the Prophetic Missions	303
PART III: SOTERIOLOGY AND ESCHATOLOGY	319
12. Ways of Individual Salvation: Paradise of Knowledge	
and Hell of Ignorance	321
13. The Last Stage of the Cycle of the Word: The Ummis	
and the End of Time	339
CONCLUSION: THE JĀWIDĀN-NĀMA IN THE CONTEXT	
OF ISLAMIC THOUGHT	387
The Jāwidān-nāma as Qur'ānic Commentary	
The Jāwidān-nāma, Sufism and Esoteric Shi'ism	
The Messianic Project of the Jāwidān-nāma and the Use	
of Christian Apocalyptic Texts	427
Final Notes	434
Glossary of Key Technical Terms	
Inventory I: Hadīths and Sayings	
Inventory II: Biblical Citations	
Index of Qur'ānic Citations	
Persian Text of the Citations	
Anonymous Note concerning the Thematic Organisation	
of the Fragments of the Jāwidān-nāma	483
Citations from the Jāwidān-nāma	485
Citations from the Works of Fadl Allāh's Followers	550
Astarābādī Vocabulary	553
Bibliography	
General Index	

Note on Transliteration and Conventions

The transliteration of Arabic and Persian in this book follows the rules of the *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, with some modifications: j instead of dj, ch instead of č, q instead of k. Turkish transliteration conforms to modern Turkish orthography.

Unless otherwise indicated, the translation of all Qur'ānic verses follows that of A. J. Arberry, *The Koran Interpreted*, occasionally with some modifications required by the context.

Qur'ānic verse references are given in the text. References of $had\bar{i}ths$ and biblical citations are summarised, in alphabetical order, in Inventories I and II. The footnotes in the main text specify the entry number in the relevant Inventory.

Unless otherwise indicated, all citations in Parts One to Three are from the manuscript British Library Oc.Or.5957 of the Jāwidān-nāmayi kabīr, the magnum opus of Fadl Allāh Astarābādī, known also, with reference to its incipit, as the Jāwidān-nāma-yi shish ibtidā'.

The original Persian text of the long citations from the Jāwidānnāma and the works of Fadl Allāh's followers is included at the end of the book. In order to facilitate the location of the original text of any particular citation, the Persian text of citations is arranged according to the numbers of the corresponding folios.

Preface and Acknowledgements

When, in the mid-1990s, I came to Paris with a small book of 'Imād al-Dīn Nasīmī's poetry in my pocket, I could not have known that it would take me on a long and surprising journey.¹ In fact, I nearly forgot this book for the next few years, overtaken by work on another project. However, when the time came to choose the topic for my Master's dissertation, Nasīmī's poetry suddenly came back to my mind, singing its strange distiches. These verses from the 9th/15th century had an almost post-modernist ring to them, with their resonant lines reverberating the same phoneme or syllable several times, then suddenly flowing into beautiful, powerful words and rhymes. I knew next to nothing about Nasīmī, except that he was a courageous man who died flayed alive. I knew still less about his intellectual and spiritual background. The short introduction to his book of poetry mentioned a group called Hurūfīs and a certain Fadl Allāh from Astarābād, their leader, whose teachings would have much

¹ Nasīmī (d. 820/1417-1418), the famous poet and legendary figure, especially in the Turkic world was, during a certain period, one of the closest followers of Fadl Allāh Astarābādī, the founder of the Hurūfī movement. For the general information about Nasīmī, see F. Babinger, 'Nesīmī', *El2*, vol. 8, p. 8, and A. Gölpınarlı, 'Nesīmī', *Islâm Ansiklopedisi* (İstanbul, 1960), vol. 9, pp. 206-207. A more detailed account on his life and works can be found in 'A. Mirfetrous, *Zindagī, ash'ār wa 'aqā id-i Nasīmī, shā'ir wa mutafakkir-i hurūfī* ([Stockholm?], 1992); Kathleen R. F. Burrill, *The Quatrains of Nesimi, Fourteenth-Century Turkic Hurufī* (The Hague and Paris, 1972) and B. S. Amoretti, 'Caratteristiche hurufīte del divano persiano di Nesimi', *Studi Iranici* 17 (1977), pp. 267-285. For Nasīmī's influence in the Arab world, see H. T. Norris, 'Aspects of the Influence of Nesimi's Hurufī Verse, and his Martyrdom, in the Arab East between the 16th and 18th Centuries', in G. Veinstein, ed., *Syncrétismes et hérésies dans l'Orient seldjoukide et ottoman (XIV^e-XVIII^e siècle)* (Paris, 2005), pp. 163-182, and on Nasīmī as a figure of Hallājian legend, see L. Massignon, *La Passion de Husayn ibn Mansûr Hallâj* (Paris, 1975), vol. 2, pp. 261-268.

influenced Nasīmī. But who were the Hurūfīs and what kind of teachings found expression in Nasīmī's poetry?

When I mentioned these questions in a conversation with Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi, my supervisor at that time, I did not seriously consider them as a possible topic for academic work. After all, Nasīmī was a famous poet and I was sure that his own works and anything related to them had been thoroughly researched long ago. I only expected some references from my erudite professor. I was surprised to hear that most of the Hurūfī texts had not yet been published, and that the primary sources of Hurūfī thought, the works of Fadl Allāh Astarābādī himself, were still little known. This is how I found myself studying the few published Hurūfī works for my Master's dissertation, then embarking on the work on Fadl Allāh's magnum opus, the Jāwidān-nāma-yi kabīr, the 'Great Book of Eternity', for my Ph.D.²

I will not dwell here on the particular features of the Jāwidān-nāma as a text; they are described further below in the Introduction. It should be mentioned, however, that the Jāwidān-nāma does not contain any systematic presentation of the doctrine. It is essentially a huge corpus of fragments. The main purpose of the present book is to produce a comprehensive presentation of the central doctrinal lines of the Jāwidān-nāma, such as they appear from the analytical study of the relevant fragments.

The Introduction begins with a general outline of Fadl Allāh's spiritual career and of Hurūfī history after his death. It also contains a discussion of the significance of Fadl Allāh's ideas in the context of intense transformation that the Eastern Islamic world underwent in the period between the Mongol invasion and the consolidation of the Ottoman, Şafawid and Mughal empires. A separate section of the Introduction summarises the history of academic research on the Hurūfis. It is followed by some methodological remarks directly related to the assessment of the existing research, its achievements, its shortcomings and the place of the present book therein. Methodological observations are continued in the last section of the

² O. Mir-Kasimov, 'Etude de textes hurūfī anciens: l'oeuvre fondatrice de Fadlallāh Astarābādī' (Paris, 2007).

Introduction, with a particular focus on the structural particularities of the *Jāwidān-nāma*.

The next three parts of the book (Chapters 1 to 13) deal with aspects of Fadl Allah's doctrine such as it can be restored from the body of fragments. Part One (Chapters 1 to 6) brings together cosmogonical and cosmological doctrines of the Jāwidān-nāma. These doctrines are centred on the specific conception of the ontological divine Word. The creation and temporal evolution of the universe are described as a kind of metaphysical linguistics, with its semantics (Chapter 1), morphology (Chapter 2) and syntax (Chapters 3, 5 and 6). Within this presentation, the Human Being, Time and Universe appear as differentiated equivalents of the original Word, essentially identical to each other because they are produced in accordance with the same primary model. The Excursus (Chapter 4) focuses more particularly on knowledge and love, two pivotal elements of the Jāwidān-nāma's anthropology. Part Two (Chapters 7 to 11) is devoted to the Jāwidān-nāma's prophetology, that is, the progressive revelation (tanzīl) of the original divine Word through prophetic missions and its return to the origin (ta wil) at the end of time. The central themes of this part are the relationship between divine and human languages, and the theory of ta wil, which is the core doctrine of the whole work. Related to the latter is the theory of the 'motherly' (ummī) knowledge, and the 'motherly' prophets and saints, which seems to be an original development (Chapter 10), interestingly combining mainstream Sunni prophetology and eschatology with Shi'i ideas concerning the role of the Imāms and their saintly investiture, the walāya. Part Three (Chapters 12 and 13) deal respectively with the ways of individual and collective salvation, including the Jāwidān-nāma's eschatological views. The Conclusion contains a preliminary examination, based on the contents of the Jāwidān-nāma, especially concerning the place of Fadl Allāh's eclectic thought in the landscape of Muslim intellectual and spiritual currents, and a reflection, also based on the textual evidence of Jāwidān-nāma, on the possible messianic project of Fadl Allah, his approach to the reunification of the Muslim community, and reactualisation of the universal message of Islam addressed to mankind as a whole, in particular to Jews and Christians. This last purpose can arguably be discerned behind Fadl Allah's extensive use of canonical biblical texts

and apocrypha, which constitutes one of the most intriguing features of the *Jāwidān-nāma*.

It is impossible to mention here all friends and colleagues who contributed, in one way or another, to the maturation of this book over many years. It is my pleasure to extend my heartfelt gratitude to Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi, my thesis adviser and dear friend. All members of my Ph.D. committee - Denise Aigle, Denis Gril and Thierry Zarcone - contributed, in different ways, to the development of my postdoctoral projects. My sincere thanks to Shahzad Bashir, for stimulating exchanges and for kindly sharing with me his copies of Hurufi manuscripts. Meetings and conversations with Frédéric Gabriel, Asma Hilali and Lahcen Daaif ever renewed the chevaleresque ideal of the 'search for knowledge'. Hassan Ansari and Daniel De Smet were always helpful and generously shared their impressive erudition. Discussions with Pierre Legendre, who was generous with his time when discussing my book project, were crucial for my understanding of academic book writing. Jean-Daniel Dubois, Anna van den Kerchove and Simon Mimouni helped me to find relevant Jewish and Christian parallels to some specific doctrinal positions of the Jāwidān-nāma. Saïd Amir Arjomand, Kathryn Babayan, Gerhard Böwering, William Chittick, Patricia Crone, Devin DeWeese, Pierre Lory and Ahmet Yaşar Ocak provided valuable suggestions and encouragement at the early stages of the work on this book.

The thriving academic atmosphere at the Department of Academic Research and Publications of The Institute of Ismaili Studies, which I joined in 2011 and where the writing of this book commenced, as well as discussions with colleagues I met in London and nearby – Omar Alí-de-Unzaga, Mushegh Asatryan, İlker Evrim Binbaş, Stephen Burge, Nadia Eboo Jamal, Janis Esots, David Hollenberg, Arzina Lalani, Toby Mayer, Matthew Melvin-Koushki, Eric Ormsby, Judith Pfeiffer, Miklos Sarkozy, Yuri Stoyanov and many others – were essential and contributed, either directly or indirectly, to the process of its maturation.

My special thanks to the Institute's Co-Director, Farhad Daftary, as well as to Maria De Cillis and Gurdofarid Miskinzoda for their attentive reading of the manuscript and for accepting this monograph in the Shi'i Heritage Series. I was also fortunate to have careful, erudite and precise anonymous reviewers, whose detailed feedback, critiques and thoughtful suggestions helped me greatly to improve the composition of the book. I would like to extend my deep appreciation to the Shi'i Heritage Series Editorial Board, and especially to Hermann Landolt who kindly read the entire draft of this book and made many valuable comments. My special thanks to Jalal Badakhchani for checking the Persian text. Working with the Department's Senior Editor, Kutub Kassam, has been a gratifying and enriching experience. I am indebted to him for his patient, thoughtful and rigorous reading and editing of the text, and for many erudite remarks and valuable references, which not only significantly improved the structure and fluidity of the presentation but also, on several occasions, stimulated a revision of contents. Needless to say, I am alone to blame for all possible shortcomings. I would also like to thank Nadia Holmes for her editorial assistance in preparation of this book for publication, as well as Russell Harris and Patricia Salazar, for their help with the selection and layout of the cover image, acquisition of copyright permissions and kind assistance through the publishing process.

The staff of several libraries lent a helping hand to my research. I would like to acknowledge the kind assistance and cooperation of the Süleymaniye and University Libraries in Istanbul, the Vatican Library, the Bibliothèque Nationale and the library of the École Pratique des Hautes Études in Paris, the Staatsbibliothek and the libraries of various departments of the Free University in Berlin, the British Library, the Library of The Institute of Ismaili Studies and that of the School of Oriental and African Studies in London and the Cambridge University Library. I am particularly thankful to Gudrun Schubert, who helped me to find the then still uncatalogued Hurūfī manuscripts at the library of the University of Basel, to Renate Würsch for her assistance through the process of reproduction of the folio used on the cover of this publication, and to the staff of this library.

Over the years of research, I benefited from significant institutional support. Grants from the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), especially the Laboratoire d'Études sur les Monothéismes (LEM) and Laboratoire Islam Médiéval, enabled me to participate in conferences and to work with the manuscripts. Fellowships from the French Institute for Anatolian Studies (IFEA) in Istanbul enabled me to research the manuscript collections in Turkish libraries. A Dissertation Writing Scholarship from The Institute of Ismaili Studies helped me to complete my doctoral thesis from which this book developed. A postdoctoral research fellowship at the Institute for Advanced Study at Nantes, France, was a crucial experience in making me conscious of broader interdisciplinary issues related to my area of research. A grant from the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation allowed me to significantly develop the research leading to this book beyond my Ph.D. dissertation. I am especially grateful to Sabine Schmidtke, my scientific host at the Institute of Islamic Studies, Free University of Berlin, where I benefited from the exchanges with a brilliant group of scholars.

To my parents, Rufat and Aytekin, and parents-in-law, Michel and Dominique, to all my family, for their love and unwavering confidence, and especially to my wife Caroline and our daughter Jamila, for their patience and merry laughter, without which this work would never have been completed, thanks beyond thanks.