Nie Hongyin

Family Models: The Model of the Tangut Work
Newly Collected Biographies of Affection and Filial Piety

The Tangut work *Newly Collected Biographies of Affection and Filial Piety* (hereafter *NCB*), found by the Kozlov Expedition in the Khara-khoto ruins and now preserved as inv. No. 616 at the St. Petersburg Branch of the Institute of Oriental Studies, Russian Academy of Sciences, was first recognized by Nevsky and described by Gorbacheva and Kychanov. More than twenty years later, Keping gave us a thorough study of this interesting compilation, including Russian translation, detailed commentary and photolithograph of the Tangut original. The most recent publication of the same photos can be found in the *Russian Collection of the Heishuicheng Manuscripts* (pp. 120–138), issued by the Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing House in 1999.

It is already known so far that the *NCB* was compiled and translated into Tangut by a Xixia minister Cao Daole, in order to propagate a sense of Chinese ethics and morals. The last half (*juan xia*) of the extant text of *NCB* presents a total of 44 items of biography collected from Chinese historical records, of which 38 items were identified by Keping in her brilliant study, except that the name Wang Xiang was mistranslated into Wang Xiu.

Keping admirably searched for the original of almost each item in various classics, but previous investigation leads us to believe that scholars and officials in Xixia were not as knowledgeable as those in the Song dynasty, so we may ask: Did Cao Daole really look over such a vast array of Chinese historical materials in preparing so apparently insignificant a booklet?

There are only five entries that remain unidentified in Keping’s study, and just two among them show us the likely answer: Before he started to compose and translate his

---

* I would like to thank Ruth W. Dunnell for the English revisions and academic suggestions in preparing this article.


4 Ecang heishuicheng wenxian ֘㮣咥∈ජ᭛⤂. ֘㮣咥∈ජ᭛⤂classNames. ֘㮣咥∈ජ᭛⤂外国语研究院、中国社会科学院民族研究所、上海古籍出版社. 上海, 1999.

5 As mentioned by Gorbacheva and Kychanov (Горбачева З.И., Кычанов Е.И. Тангуцкие рукописи и китографы. М., 1963. С. 56), the name Cao Daole 曹道乐 might also be rendered as Cao Daoan 曹道安.

6 This misunderstanding must have come from a former study, in which Keping (*Kemnc K.B. ︐.box ︐.box ︐.box*). 被误解了这个名称为 Wang Xiu.

7 This may be demonstrated by the frequent mistranslation in some Tangut versions of Chinese classics, see my analyses (*Nie Hongyin*. Xinji Cixiaozhuan...). The unidentified items at that time were translated into Russian by Keping: No. 7 Sin Pan, No. 11 Lou Chanya, No. 18, Han He, No. 19 I Men and No. 44 Chji Tsza. Now we know that they should be Xue Bao, Liu Zhongying 藤仲英, Han Huang 卢焕, Ni Meng 任萌 and Xi Jian 西鉴 (*Nie Hongyin. Xinji Cixiaozhuan...*).

© Nie Hongyin, 2008
NCB, Cao Daole did not read volumes of Chinese classics, but merely took a single short
text as the chief source. The book in question is called Family Models 家范 (Jia Fan,
hereafter FM), compiled by the famous Northern Song statesman Sima Guang 司马光
(1019–1086). To begin, we find two items of biography in common between NCB and FM,
one of them being the story of Liu Zhongying. ¹⁰

Liu Zhongying, holding the position of Tianping Jiedushi (military governor of
Tianping) during the Tang, treated his uncle Taibao (Grand Guardian) Liu Gongquan as
respectfully as his father. Being promoted to a position of Dajingzhao Yin (Superior
Metropolitan Governor),¹¹ when he met his uncle along the marketplace, Liu Zhongying
still dismounted from his horse and stood respectfully, and then remounted the horse
after his uncle had passed. Every evening he went to the uncle’s place dressed
 immaculately and extended respectful greetings. The uncle often praised [him]: “After
he won promotion, my nephew becomes more and more respectful, and serves me as
well as [he serves] his father.” It is the ancient etiquette for a person of virtue to serve the
uncle in the way of serving the father.¹²

A corresponding passage occurs in the sixth volume of FM:

So did Liu Bi in the Tang narrate the deeds of his father, Tianping Jiedushi Liu
Zhongying: He treated his uncle the Taibao (Liu Gongquan) as Yuangong (his father). So
long as he was not critically ill, he did not go to see the Taibao without wearing his
girdle. Serving as Dajingzhao Yantieshi, when he met the Taibao in the marketplace,
he would dismount from the horse and stand respectfully, and then get back in his carriage
after his uncle’s horse had passed. Every evening he waited for the Taibao’s arrival and
extended greetings, wearing his girdle. Many times the Taibao spoke of this, [that his
nephew] did not make even a slight change after his promotion. The Taibao often said
among the ministers: “Yuangong’s son serves me as well as [he serves] his father.” It is
the ancient etiquette for a person of virtue to serve the uncle in the way of serving the father.

The other is the story of Han Huang:¹³

Han Huang, holding the position of Pingzhangshi (Manager of Affairs) during the
Song,¹⁴ had an infant son. His younger brother dandled it in his hands and went out to
play, but he dropped it down against the house steps and it died. Han Huang ordered his

---

¹ Because there are no current publications of FM, I have to use the manuscript in Siku Quanshu 四库全书, see
vol. 696 of the photo-offset of Siku Quanshu in Wenyuange by Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing

¹⁰ Kenmin K.K. Вновь собранные записи о любви... С. 161.

¹¹ Here the official position of Dajingzhao Yin (Superior Metropolitan Governor) is recorded as Dajingzhao
Yantieshi (Inspector of salt and iron in the Superior Metropolitan Region) in FM. Refers to the area where the
dynastic capital was located.

¹² Chinese translation:

唐柳泌叙其父天平节度使仲郢行事云：事季父太保如事元公。非甚疾，见太保，
未尝不乘御。任京兆节度使，通衙遇太保，必下马端笏，候太保马过，方登车。
每暮，束带迎太保首候取居。太保屡以为言，终不以官达稍改。太保常言于公
卿间云：“元公之子事某如事严父。”占之贤者事诸父如父，礼也。

¹³ Here the word “Song” 未 is an error for “Tang” 未.
wife: “Do not cry, or you will make your brother broken-hearted.” Being an elder brother like this, how can other people drive a wedge between them? Regarding his son like this, how [much less would] he regard money and properties?15

Here is the corresponding passage in the seventh volume of FM:

Pingzhangshi Han Huang had an infant born by his wife Liu. His younger brother Huang played with it in his hands, but accidentally dropped it against the house steps and it died. Han Huang admonished his wife: “Do not cry piteously, or you will make your brother broken-hearted.” Being an elder brother like this, how can wives or other people drive a wedge between them?

It is significant that the two stories occur nowhere else in Chinese writings of Tang and Song era, including the biographies in Tangshu, but only in Sima Guang’s FM. This fact leads us to a preliminary conclusion that Sima Guang’s FM must have been the most significant reference in the compilation of Cao Daole’s NCB.

More support can be found in other entries whose stories have counterparts in Chinese historical records but with a few sentences of appraisal attached by Sima Guang himself. We see that both the original stories and Sima’s appraisals were translated without differentiation by Cao Daole in FM. Take the story of Diwu Lun16 for example:

Diwu Lun, a person of the Han era, was impartial in nature. Someone asked: “Are you unselfish?” He answered: “Once when my nephew was ill, I went to see him ten times a night, and then fell asleep. After that when my son was ill, I did not go to see him, but could not fall asleep the whole night. Thus, am I unselfish?” A gentleman at that time commented: “How could not Diwu Lun regard his nephew as important as his son? Having gone to see the nephew, he was relieved, while having not gone to see the son, he was not relieved. The reason for speaking of it is to reveal his morality.”17

The main part of the above story originates from Hou Hanshu (vol. 41), but the statement beginning with “彼时君子论曰” is the appraisal appended by Sima Guang to the text.18 The story of Li Ji in NCB19 shows the same structure:

Li Ji was a native of Lihu, Caozhou Prefecture in the Tang era. When he served as a prime minister, his elder sister was ill. Li Ji cooked gruel [for her] himself and his beard and hair became singed. The sister said: “You, prime minister, have many servants. Why put yourself to so much trouble?” Li Ji replied: “It is not because I do not have servants, but now my sister is already old, I am also of venerable age. How is it that I always want

---

15 Chinese translation: 韩滉之子，宋时为平章事。有一幼子，滉之弟使其立于掌上戏，然而坠落，死者，滉命其叔于台阶而夫人；“夫汝勿嚎，恐伤叔郎心矣。”夫为兄如此，则凡他人所能高尚？视子如此，则视钱财若何耶？

16 Кемпс К.Б. Вновь собранные записки о любви... С. 157–158.

17 Chinese translation: 第五伦者，汉时人也。本性平正。人或问曰： “汝有私乎？”对曰： “昔吾侄患病，一夜十番往视，然后得眠。后吾子患病，虽不往视，而竟夕失眠。若是则无私乎？”彼时君子论曰： “第五伦者，厚任岂不如子哉？往视侄，故心不安。未往视子，故心不安。此有仁，实所以见彼也。”

18 The corresponding item can be seen in FM, vol. 6: 汉第五伦，性至公，或问曰：“公有私乎？”对曰：“吾侄子病，一夜十往，而竟安寝。吾子有病，虽不省视，而竟夕不寐，若是者，岂可谓无私乎？”伯鱼，贤者，岂肯薄其子而不如其子哉？直以数往视之，故心安，终夕不视，故心不安耳。而伯鱼更以此语人，益所以见其公也。

19 Кемпс К.Б. Вновь собранные записки о любви... С. 171–172.
to cook your gruel? Brothers and sisters are the most intimate of relatives, being worried
and pleased together, being different from others. Between them, brothers share the same
food and wear the same clothes in childhood, so they cannot help loving each other, but
after growing up, each cherishes a wife and children, so, even though their love is
profound, it inevitably diminishes somewhat. The wives of brothers rely on the brothers,
so they are outsiders with the spirit of competition and jealousy. Only if the brothers love
each other deeply will harm be avoided. Thus the estrangement of brothers causes sons
and the nephews to be estranged, the estrangement of sons and nephews makes relatives
hostile, and when that happens, who can deliver them? Therefore, thinking of this fact, I
cook the gruel myself.”

Corresponding passages occur as two different items in the seventh volume of FM,
where the text after “夫兄弟姊妹者” is not in the entry for Li Ji, but in another one
quoted from Yanshi Jiaxun following it. The blurring of the line between two
different entries also indicates a close relation between NCB and FM.

Sima Guang compiled FM, in ten volumes and nineteen chapters, by collecting the
biographies from various historical records and attaching his own appraisals. The content in
the last half (chapters 6–10) of FM is noticeably similar to that in the last half of NCB, even
in sequence of the stories, especially the chapters on “Mother-in-laws and daughter-in-
laws”, “Father’s brothers and brother’s sons”, “Elder and younger sister-in-laws”, and
“Mother’s brothers and sister’s sons”. It is a pity that the first half of NCB is not preserved
in the Khara-khoto monuments, or else we could find its correspondence with the first half
(chapter 1–5) of FM.

We do not know how many Chinese books Cao Daole read at that time, though he seems
to have had a comparatively intimate knowledge of Sima Guang’s works, including the
famous Zizhi Tongjian in Sibu Congkan, photomechanical printings by Shangwu Yinshuguan.

In Chinese: 德行集, see inf. No. 799, 3947 of the Institute and Gorbacheva and Kychanov (Горбачева З.И.,
Кычанов Е.Н. Тангутские книгология..., С. 59).
Tangut, one of them from *Zizhi Tongjian* and the others from his *Wenji*, even prefaced by “Sima Wengong said” 司马温公曰. Sima Guang, an illustrious minister of the Northern Song dynasty who participated in political and military planning at the Song court against Xixia, was an “enemy” of Tanguts in the early period of state establishment. But, after one and a half centuries, bitter memories faded. The severance of political and trade relations considerably abated the hostility of Tanguts, and evoked instead memories of great reverence for the late Northern Song dynasty. For that reason we can see from the preface to the *Collection of Morality and Conduct* that the ministers advised their emperor “do not ignore the advice just because of who deliver it” 不以人废言.

Thus we may believe that Sima Guang’s *FM* was the most important model for Cao Daole in preparing his *NCB*, or in other words, *NCB*, as a Tangut imitation of *FM*, was selected and compiled on the basis of Sima Guang’s work in question.

A total of 38 entries in *NCB* have a corresponding passage in *FM*, which demonstrates that *FM* was the source of Cao Daole’s translation, in spite of the entries’ occurrence in other Chinese classics as well, for example, *Shiji*, *Dongguan Hanji*, and so on. The remaining ten items not occurring in *FM* come from the following four classical texts respectively:

*Hou Hanshu* 后汉书: Ma Yuan 马援, Xu Jing 许荆, Song Hong 宋弘, Sheng Dao’s wife 盛道姜, Ni Meng 倪萌,27

*Lienü Zhuan* 列女传: Feng Jieyu 冯婕妤, Ban Jieyu 班婕妤,28

*Zizhi Tongjian* 资治通鉴: Xia Lei 夏累;

*Xiaozi Zhuan* 孝子传: Tian Zhen 田真;29

Unidentified: Tai Si 太史.30

I do not know whether some of these ten items were excised from *FM*. Although the *Siku Tiyao* 四库提要 editors state that the edition preserved must have been the original from that time, it is not impossible that the original manuscript of *FM* underwent changes by later redactors as it spread to the Gansu Corridor over the eleventh century.

Whatever the case, we can best describe the process of compiling and translating *NCB* as follows:

Cao Daole, taking Sima Guang’s *FM* as his model, first established the structure of *NCB*, selected some simple popular stories from *FM* and assigned them to each of its chapters, and then supplied a few stories from some other common historical works, “assembling” the master copy of *NCB* for translation. No doubt that this is the precise meaning of “newly collected” 新集 in the title “Newly Collected Biographies of Affection and Filial Piety.”
ИССЛЕДОВАНИЯ

Summary

Не Хун-инъ
Семейные правила:
тангу́тский текст «Вновь собранные записи о любви к младшим и почтении к старшим»

Статья посвящена истории создания тангутского текста «Вновь собранные записи о любви к младшим и почтении к старшим» министром государства Си Ся Цюо Дао-лэ. Как показал текстологический анализ, проведенный в статье, Цюо Даоэ взял за основу своего сочинения текст Сыма Куна «Семейные правила», выбирая для своей книги несколько историй, к которым добавил ряд бытовавших в то время рассказов, и скомпоновал их согласно своему замыслу. Затем книга была переведена на тангутский язык, поэтому в названии текста добавлены слова «вновь собранные записи».