

Nie Hongyin

**Family Models: The Model of the Tangut Work
Newly Collected Biographies of Affection and Filial Piety***

The Tangut work *Newly Collected Biographies of Affection and Filial Piety* (hereafter *NCB*),¹ found by the Kozlov Expedition in the Khara-khoto ruins and now preserved as inv. No. 616 at the St. Petersburg Branch of the Institute of Oriental Studies, Russian Academy of Sciences, was first recognized by Nevsky² and described by Gorbacheva and Kychanov. More than twenty years later, Keping gave us a thorough study of this interesting compilation, including Russian translation, detailed commentary and photolithograph of the Tangut original.³ The most recent publication of the same photos can be found in the *Russian Collection of the Heishuicheng Manuscripts* (pp. 120–138), issued by the Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing House in 1999.⁴

It is already known so far that the *NCB* was compiled and translated into Tangut by a Xixia minister Cao Daole,⁵ in order to propagate a sense of Chinese ethics and morals. The last half (*juan xia*) of the extant text of *NCB* presents a total of 44 items of biography collected from Chinese historical records, of which 38 items were identified by Keping in her brilliant study, except that the name Wang Xiang 王祥 was mistranslated into Wang Xiu 王修.⁶ Keping admirably searched for the original of almost each item in various classics, but previous investigation leads us to believe that scholars and officials in Xixia were not as knowledgeable as those in the Song dynasty,⁷ so we may ask: Did Cao Daole really look over such a vast array of Chinese historical materials in preparing so apparently insignificant a booklet?

There are only five entries that remain unidentified in Keping's study,⁸ and just two among them show us the likely answer: Before he started to compose and translate his

* I would like to thank Ruth W. Dunnell for the English revisions and academic suggestions in preparing this article.

¹ Or in Chinese: *Xinji Cixiaoji* 新集慈孝记 (*Keping K.B.* Вновь собранные записи о любви к младшим и почтении к старшим. М., 1990) and *Xinji Cixiaozhuan* 新集慈孝传 (*Nie Hongyin* 聂鸿音. Xixiawen Xinji Cixiaozhuan kaobu 西夏文《新集慈孝传》考补 // *Minzu Yuwen*, 1. 1995).

² *Невский Н.А.* Тангутская филология. М., 1960. Т. 1. С. 86.

³ *Кепинг К.Б.* Вновь собранные записи о любви к младшим и почтении к старшим. М., 1990.

⁴ *Ecang heishuicheng wenxian* 俄藏黑水城文献. 俄罗斯科学院东方研究所圣彼得堡分所、中国社会科学院民族研究所、上海古籍出版社. 上海, 1999.

⁵ As mentioned by Gorbacheva and Kychanov (*Гобрачева З.И., Кычанов Е.И.* Тангутские рукописи и киелографы. М., 1963. С. 56), the name Cao Daole 曹道乐 might also be rendered as Cao Daoan 曹道安.

⁶ This misunderstanding must have come from a former study, in which Keping (*Кепинг К.Б.* Лес категорий. Утраченная китайская «Лэй шу» в тангутском переводе. М., 1983. С. 107) also mistranslated this name as Wang Xiu.

⁷ This may be demonstrated by the frequent mistranslation in some Tangut versions of Chinese classics, see my analyses (*Nie Hongyin* 聂鸿音. Xixia yi Shi kao 西夏译《诗》考 // *Wenxue Yichan*, 4. 2003) of the Tangut translation of *Shi Jing* (*The Book of Odes*).

⁸ The unidentified items at that time were translated into Russian by Keping: No. 7 Sin Pan, No. 11 Lou Chanya, No. 18, Han He, No. 19 I Men and No. 44 Chji Tsza. Now we know that they should be Xue Bao 薛包, Liu Zhongying 柳仲郢, Han Huang 韩滉, Ni Meng 倪萌 and Xi Jian 郗鉴 (*Nie Hongyin*. *Xinji Cixiaozhuan*...).

NCB, Cao Daole did not read volumes of Chinese classics, but merely took a single short text as the chief source. The book in question is called *Family Models* 家范 (*Jia Fan*, hereafter *FM*), compiled by the famous Northern Song statesman Sima Guang 司马光 (1019–1086).⁹ To begin, we find two items of biography in common between *NCB* and *FM*, one of them being the story of Liu Zhongying.¹⁰

Liu Zhongying, holding the position of *Tianping Jiedushi* (military governor of Tianping) during the Tang, treated his uncle *Taibao* (Grand Guardian) Liu Gongquan as respectfully as his father. Being promoted to a position of *Dajingzhao Yin* (Superior Metropolitan Governor),¹¹ when he met his uncle along the marketplace, Liu Zhongying still dismounted from his horse and stood respectfully, and then remounted the horse after his uncle had passed. Every evening he went to the uncle's place dressed immaculately and extended respectful greetings. The uncle often praised [him]: "After he won promotion, my nephew becomes more and more respectful, and serves me as well as [he serves] his father." It is the ancient etiquette for a person of virtue to serve the uncle in the way of serving the father.¹²

A corresponding passage occurs in the sixth volume of *FM*:

So did Liu Bi in the Tang narrate the deeds of his father, *Tianping Jiedushi* Liu Zhongying: He treated his uncle the *Taibao* (Liu Gongquan) as *Yuangong* (his father). So long as he was not critically ill, he did not go to see the *Taibao* without wearing his girdle. Serving as *Dajingzhao Yantieshi*, when he met the *Taibao* in the marketplace, he would dismount from the horse and stand respectfully, and then get back in his carriage after his uncle's horse had passed. Every evening he waited for the *Taibao*'s arrival and extended greetings, wearing his girdle. Many times the *Taibao* spoke of this, [that his nephew] did not make even a slight change after his promotion. The *Taibao* often said among the ministers: "*Yuangong*'s son serves me as well as [he serves] his father." It is the ancient etiquette for a person of virtue to serve the uncle in the way of serving the father.

唐柳泌叙其父天平节度使仲郢行事云：事季父太保如事元公。非甚疾，见太保，未尝不束带。任大京兆盐铁使，通衢遇太保，必下马端笏，候太保马过，方登车。每暮，束带迎太保马首候起居。太保屡以为言，终不以官达稍改。太保常言于公卿间云：“元公之子事某如事严父。”古之贤者事诸父如父，礼也。

The other is the story of Han Huang.¹³

Han Huang, holding the position of *Pingzhangshi* (Manager of Affairs) during the Song,¹⁴ had an infant son. His younger brother dandled it in his hands and went out to play, but he dropped it down against the house steps and it died. Han Huang ordered his

⁹ Because there are no current publications of *FM*, I have to use the manuscript in *Siku Quanshu* 四库全书, see vol. 696 of the photo-offset of *Siku Quanshu* in *Wenyuange* by Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing House, 1987.

¹⁰ Кепинг К.Б. Вновь собранные записи о любви... С. 161.

¹¹ Here the official position of *Dajingzhao Yin* (Superior Metropolitan Governor) is recorded as *Dajingzhao Yantieshi* (Inspector of salt and iron in the Superior Metropolitan Region) in *FM*. Refers to the area where the dynastic capital was located.

¹² Chinese translation:

沿市并见叔时，亦下马恭敬而立，叔过，然后乘马。每日晚夕时，端正衣冠而前往叔驾前敬问。叔常赞誉：“我侄加官，愈增恭敬，侍奉我如父。”夫古时贤者依父礼事叔者，礼也。

¹³ Кепинг К.Б. Вновь собранные записи о любви... С. 166–167.

¹⁴ Here the word "Song" 宋 is an error for "Tang" 唐.

wife: “Do not cry, or you will make your brother broken-hearted.” Being an elder brother like this, how can other people drive a wedge between them? Regarding his son like this, how [much less would] he regard money and properties?¹⁵

Here is the corresponding passage in the seventh volume of *FM*:

Pingzhangshi Han Huang had an infant born by his wife Liu. His younger brother Huang played with it in his hands, but accidentally dropped it against the house steps and it died. Han Huang admonished his wife: “Do not cry piteously, or you will make your brother broken-hearted.” Being an elder brother like this, how can wives or other people drive a wedge between them?

平章事韩滉有幼子，夫人柳氏所生也。弟湟戏于掌上，误坠阶而死。滉禁约夫人：“勿悲啼，恐伤叔郎意。”为兄如此，岂妻妾它人所能间哉？

It is significant that the two stories occur nowhere else in Chinese writings of Tang and Song era, including the biographies in *Tangshu* 唐书, but only in Sima Guang's *FM*. This fact leads us to a preliminary conclusion that Sima Guang's *FM* must have been the most significant reference in the compilation of Cao Daole's *NCB*.

More support can be found in other entries whose stories have counterparts in Chinese historical records but with a few sentences of appraisal attached by Sima Guang himself. We see that both the original stories and Sima's appraisals were translated without differentiation by Cao Daole in *FM*. Take the story of Diwu Lun¹⁶ for example:

Diwu Lun, a person of the Han era, was impartial in nature. Someone asked: “Are you unselfish?” He answered: “Once when my nephew was ill, I went to see him ten times a night, and then fell asleep. After that when my son was ill, I did not go to see him, but could not fall asleep the whole night. Thus, am I unselfish?” A gentleman at that time commented: “How could not Diwu Lun regard his nephew as important as his son? Having gone to see the nephew, he was relieved, while having not gone to see the son, he was not relieved. The reason for speaking of it is to reveal his morality.”¹⁷

The main part of the above story originates from *Hou Hanshu* 后汉书 (vol. 41), but the statement beginning with “彼时君子论曰” is the appraisal appended by Sima Guang to the text.¹⁸ The story of Li Ji in *NCB*¹⁹ shows the same structure:

Li Ji was a native of Lihu, Caozhou Prefecture in the Tang era. When he served as a prime minister, his elder sister was ill. Li Ji cooked gruel [for her] himself and his beard and hair became singed. The sister said: “You, prime minister, have many servants. Why put yourself to so much trouble?” Li Ji replied: “It is not because I do not have servants, but now my sister is already old, I am also of venerable age. How is it that I always want

¹⁵ Chinese translation: 韩滉者，宋时为平章事。有一幼子，滉之弟使其立于掌上往戏，然而坠落，死。滉命其触于台阶而夫人：“夫汝勿啼，恐伤叔郎心矣。”夫为兄如此，则岂他人所能离间？视子如此，则视钱财若何耶？

¹⁶ Кетинг К.Б. Вновь собранные записи о любви... С. 157–158.

¹⁷ Chinese translation: 第五伦者，汉时人也，本性平正。人或问曰：“汝有私乎？”对曰：“昔吾侄患病，一夜十番往视，然后得眠。后吾子患病，虽不往视，而竟夕无眠。若是则是无私乎？”彼时君子论曰：“第五伦者，厚侄岂不如子哉？往视侄，故心已安。未往视子，故心不安。语此者，实所以见德也。”

¹⁸ The corresponding item can be seen in *FM*, vol. 6: 汉第五伦，性至公。或问伦曰：“公有私乎？”对曰：“吾兄子尝病，一夜十往，退而安寝。吾子有病，虽不省视，而竟夕不眠。若是者，岂可谓无私乎？”伯鱼，贤者。岂肯厚其兄子不如其子哉？直以数往视之，故心安，终夕不视，故心不安耳。而伯鱼更以此语人，益所以见其公也。

¹⁹ Кетинг К.Б. Вновь собранные записи о любви... С. 171–172.

to cook your gruel? Brothers and sisters are the most intimate of relatives, being worried and pleased together, being different from others. Between them, brothers share the same food and wear the same clothes in childhood, so they cannot help loving each other, but after growing up, each cherishes a wife and children, so, even though their love is profound, it inevitably diminishes somewhat. The wives of brothers rely on the brothers, so they are outsiders with the spirit of competition and jealousy. Only if the brothers love each other deeply will harm be avoided. Thus the estrangement of brothers causes sons and the nephews to be estranged, the estrangement of sons and nephews makes relatives and friends grow distant, the distancing of relatives and friends makes the servants hostile, and when that happens, who can deliver them? Therefore, thinking of this fact, I cook the gruel myself.”

李勣者，唐时曹州离狐人也。为丞相时，姊患病，亲自煮粥而焚其须发。姊曰：“丞相多使人，何必亲自受累？”勣曰：“非无使人，然今阿姊已老，勣亦年长，欲久为煮粥，岂可得乎？夫兄弟姊妹者，同胞共气中为最亲，忧乐共之，与他人异。其中兄弟者，少时共食同衣，不能不相爱，然及壮时，各守妻子，故相爱心固笃，亦不能无少许之衰。姊妹者，存于兄弟，则是他人，有争求嫉妒之心。惟兄弟相爱深重，然后能离此害。故兄弟不睦则子侄不合，子侄不合则近人远离，近人远离则僮仆为讎，如此则谁救之哉？念此事，故亲自煮粥也。”

Corresponding passages occur as two different items in the seventh volume of *FM*, where the text after “夫兄弟姊妹者” is not in the entry for Li Ji,²⁰ but in another one quoted from *Yanshi Jiaxun* 颜氏家训 following it.²¹ The blurring of the line between two different entries also indicates a close relation between *NCB* and *FM*.

Sima Guang compiled *FM*, in ten volumes and nineteen chapters, by collecting the biographies from various historical records and attaching his own appraisals. The content in the last half (chapters 6–10) of *FM* is noticeably similar to that in the last half of *NCB*, even in sequence of the stories, especially the chapters on “Mother-in-laws and daughter-in-laws”, “Father’s brothers and brother’s sons”, “Elder and younger sister-in-laws”, and “Mother’s brothers and sister’s sons”.²² It is a pity that the first half of *NCB* is not preserved in the Khara-khoto monuments, or else we could find its correspondence with the first half (chapter 1–5) of *FM*.

We do not know how many Chinese books Cao Daole read at that time, though he seems to have had a comparatively intimate knowledge of Sima Guang’s works, including the famous *Zizhi Tongjian* 资治通鉴 and his *Wenji* 文集.²³ In the Khara-khoto collection of the same Institute of St. Petersburg, there is another well-preserved work compiled by Cao Daole at the end of the 12th century. This work is called *Collection of Morality and Conduct* 廉庭并,²⁴ in which four paragraphs of Sima’s works were quoted and translated into

²⁰ The corresponding item can be seen in *FM* vol. 7:

唐英公李勣贵为仆射，其姊病，必亲为燃火煮粥，火焚其须鬓。姊曰：“仆射妾多矣，何为自苦如是？”勣曰：“岂为无人耶？顾今姊年老，勣亦老，虽欲久为姊煮粥，复可得乎？”若此可谓能爱矣。

²¹ The corresponding item can be seen in *FM* vol. 7:

方其幼也，父母左提右挈，前襟后裾，食则同案，衣则传服，学则连业，游则共方。虽有悖乱之人，不能不相爱也。及其壮也，各妻其妻，各子其子。虽有笃厚之人，不能不少衰也。姊妹之比兄弟则疎薄矣，兄弟不睦则子侄不爱，子侄不爱则群从疎薄，群从疎薄则童仆为讎敌矣。如此则行路皆踏其面而蹈其心，谁救之哉？

²² In Chinese: 婆媳，叔侄，姑姊妹，舅甥。

²³ By “*Wenji*” here I mean some collected works of Sima Guang, for example, *Wenguowenzheng Simagong Ji* 温国文正司马公集 in *Sibu Congkan* 四部丛刊, photomechanical printings by Shangwu Yinshuguan.

²⁴ In Chinese: 德行集, see inf. No. 799, 3947 of the Institute and Gorbacheva and Kuchanov (*Горбачева З.И., Кучанов Е.И. Тангутские ксилографы... С. 59*).

Tangut, one of them from *Zizhi Tongjian* and the others from his *Wenji*, even prefaced by “Sima Wengong said” 司马温公曰.²⁵ Sima Guang, an illustrious minister of the Northern Song dynasty who participated in political and military planning at the Song court against Xixia, was an “enemy” of Tanguts in the early period of state establishment. But, after one and a half centuries, bitter memories faded. The severance of political and trade relations considerably abated the hostility of Tanguts, and evoked instead memories of great reverence for the late Northern Song dynasty. For that reason we can see from the preface to the *Collection of Morality and Conduct* that the ministers advised their emperor “do not ignore the advice just because of who deliver it” 不以人废言.²⁶

Thus we may believe that Sima Guang’s *FM* was the most important model for Cao Daole in preparing his *NCB*, or in other words, *NCB*, as a Tangut imitation of *FM*, was selected and compiled on the basis of Sima Guang’s work in question.

A total of 38 entries in *NCB* have a corresponding passage in *FM*, which demonstrates that *FM* was the source of Cao Daole’s translation, in spite of the entries’ occurrence in other Chinese classics as well, for example, *Shiji* 史记, *Dongguan Hanji* 东观汉记 and so on. The remaining ten items not occurring in *FM* come from the following four classical texts respectively:

Hou Hanshu 后汉书: Ma Yuan 马援, Xu Jing 许荆, Song Hong 宋弘, Sheng Dao’s wife 盛道妻, Ni Meng 倪萌;²⁷

Lienü Zhuan 列女传: Feng Jieyu 冯婕妤, Ban Jieyu 班婕妤;²⁸

Zizhi Tongjian 资治通鉴: Xia Lei 侠累;

Xiaozi Zhuan 孝子传: Tian Zhen 田真;²⁹

Unidentified: Tai Si 太姒.³⁰

I do not know whether some of these ten items were excised from *FM*. Although the *Siku Tiyaoyao* 四库提要 editors state that the edition preserved must have been the original from that time, it is not impossible that the original manuscript of *FM* underwent changes by later redactors as it spread to the Gansu Corridor over the eleventh century.

Whatever the case, we can best describe the process of compiling and translating *NCB* as follows:

Cao Daole, taking Sima Guang’s *FM* as his model, first established the structure of *NCB*, selected some simple popular stories from *FM* and assigned them to each of its chapters, and then supplied a few stories from some other common historical works, “assembling” the master copy of *NCB* for translation. No doubt that this is the precise meaning of “newly collected” 新集 in the title “Newly Collected Biographies of Affection and Filial Piety.”

²⁵ Nie Hongyin 聂鸿音. *Xixiawen Daxingji Yanjiu* 西夏文德行集研究, Lanzhou, 2002. C. 147–149.

²⁶ Nie Hongyin 聂鸿音. *Xixiawen Daxingji Yanjiu*... C. 134.

²⁷ The story of Ni Meng in *NCB* corresponds with that in the 16th volume of *Dongguan Hanji*, but Yao Zhiyin 姚之骅 pointed out in his *Houhanshu Buyi* 后汉书补逸 (vol. 6) that it could be a lost fragment of *Hou Hanshu*. See the photo-offset of *Siku Quanshu* in *Wenyuange* by Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing House in 1987.

²⁸ It is noticeable that these two items are found together in *Lienü Zhuan* as well as in *NCB*.

²⁹ Because the original of *Xiaozi Zhuan* was long lost, we can only find the story of Tian Zhen in *Xu Qixieji* 续齐谐记 quoted in the 489th volume of *Taiping Yulan* 太平御览:

京兆田真，三人分财。堂前有紫荆，花叶茂异，共议破为三分，明截之。尔夕树即枯死。真见之，惊谓弟曰：“花本同株，当分析枯悴，况人兄弟孔怀，而可离异？是不如树也。兄弟相感更合。”

³⁰ The earliest version of the story may be found in the *Commentary of Shi Jing* (*Daya Sizhai*, 大雅思齐) by Kong Yingda 孔颖达, but the literary style of this entry in *NCB* is not as elegant as that in the classics, so it must have been selected from some popular historical reader of that time.

Summary

He Хун-инь

**Семейные правила:
тангутский текст «Вновь собранные записи
о любви к младшим и почтении к старшим»**

Статья посвящена истории создания тангутского текста «Вновь собранные записи о любви к младшим и почтении к старшим» министром государства Си Ся Цао Дао-лэ. Как показал текстологический анализ, проведенный в статье, Цао Даолэ взял за основу своего сочинения текст Сыма Гуана «Семейные правила», выбрав для своей книги несколько историй, к которым добавил ряд бытовавших в то время рассказов, и скомпоновал их согласно своему замыслу. Затем книга была переведена на тангутский язык, поэтому в названии текста добавлены слова «вновь собранные записи».